

Solid Waste RFP Proposal Evaluation Summary

Proposer Name	Company Overview	Municipal Clients	Proposed Facility (Name - Type - Location)	Union (Y - N)	Additional Enhancements	Pricing	Evaluation Criteria Summary
Athens Services	- Headquartered in City of Industry. - Employing 2,500 personnel. - Fleet of 1,500 vehicles.	- No municipalities in Orange County. - Serving (42) municipalities in Los Angeles County.	- Irwindale MRF - All Waste Streams - American Organics - Organics - Victorville - City of Industry MRF - Organics - Crown Recycling Services - C&D - Sun Valley - D.A.R.T. - Material Transfer - Downey - Puente Hills MRF - Recyclables - Frank R. Bowerman Landfill - Trash - Irvine	Yes	(2) Dedicated Operations Supervisors - Dedicated Community Relations Manager - Dedicated Municipal Account Manager - More than (2) dedicated Recycling Coordinators - Community Benefit Fund \$1 Million - Sponsor Signature Community Events - Potential complimentary or discounted Street Sweeping & Porter Services - Open dedicated office in Downtown District	- Residential (Single-Family Cart System): \$42.32 - Commercial Trash (1 Bin 1 Time Per Week): \$318.37 - Bid Alternate - Residential Billing: \$0 (At no additional cost)	Advantages: They scored highest in Related Experience, and Safety and Customer Service. Other than pricing, one of the highest rated firms.
							Disadvantages: More exceptions to the agreement than most proposers, and their pricing was significantly higher.
CR&R Environmental Services	- Headquartered in Stanton. - Employing Approx. 2,300 Personnel. - Fleet of Approx. 1,100 Vehicles.	Serving (20) municipalities in Orange County, (6) in Los Angles County, (5) in San Bernardino County, (12) in Riverside County, and (5) in Imperial County.	- CR&R Western MRF - Recyclables - Stanton - CRT C&D MRF - Stanton - CR&R South County North Campus - Recyclables/C&D - San Juan Capistrano - CR&R South County South Campus Expansion - 18.2 acre site to handle all South Orange County operations - CR&R Yuma Composting Facility - Organics - Arizona - CR&R Yuma Landfill - Trash - Arizona	Yes	- Free additional recycling cart to residents (3) Dedicated Recycling Specialists - Free Quarterly Curbside HHW Collection - Free SHARPS Collection Program - Free Residential organics pails - Free Commercial indoor organics containers (10) Scholarships per year \$10,000 - Community Sponsorship for Local Organizations \$100,000 10,000 Aluminum Reusable Cups (2) Olyns Cubes reverse vending machines - Refurbish Downtown District enclosures \$100,000 - Street Beautification & Maintenance \$200,000 - Free RNG Procurement Credit plus supplement to ensure 100% of City's procurement obligation is met \$400,000 - Biannual Residential waste characterizations - Street Sweeping services in lieu of \$1,000,000 reduction to NPDES Fee - Free bagged compost delivered to Single-Family Residents (4) bags per year upon request - Alternative Landfill disposal option at \$65/ton	- Residential (Single-Family): \$32.64 - Commercial (3cy 1x): \$275.67 - Bid Alternate - Residential Billing: \$0 (At no additional cost)	Advantages: Due to number and type of facilities, number of franchises in Orange County and program data presented in the proposal, CR&R scored highest in SB 1383 Compliance and second highest in Related Experience. Received highest score for Value Added Services, providing full SB 1383 procurement offset and additional quantified notations totaling \$800,000. Highest interview score. Provided only lower cost landfill option.
							Disadvantages: Upload challenges due to large file size resulted in submission of complete draft without artwork, and therefore scored lowest in the Document Organization category. Neglected to provide performance metric and missing table and formatting issues in the Safety and Customer Service area of the proposal.

Solid Waste RFP Proposal Evaluation Summary

Proposer Name	Company Overview	Municipal Clients	Proposed Facility (Name - Type - Location)	Union (Y - N)	Additional Enhancements	Pricing	Evaluation Criteria Summary
NASA Services	- Headquartered in Montebello. - Employing 145 personnel. - Fleet of 125+ Vehicles.	Serving (1) municipality in Orange County, (10) in Los Angeles County.	- Orange County Landfill System - Trash - Universal Waste Systems MRF & Transfer Station - Recyclables/Organics - Santa Fe Springs - Rialto Bioenergy Facility - Organics - Tierra Verde Industries - Green waste/Mixed Organics - Irvine - Greenwise Soil Technologies - Green waste - South Gate - Stanton C&D Recycling Facility - C&D - Madison Materials - C&D - Santa Ana	No	10% Discount to Schools - Charitable Organization Donation \$25,000 - Annual Scholarships \$10,000 - Annual Art Contest \$250 - Annual internal container giveaways - Establish local office in Fullerton - No rate changes to tip fee increases for the rate years in July 2027 & 2028, NASA will honor fees proposed in the first year - Downtown Commercial rates reduced by 15% - Multi-family 2-4 Unit rate reduction mirroring the single family cart rate - Monthly steam cleaning of the downtown enclosures - No-cost waste studies initially, (12) months after if needed, and every (5) years thereafter to help the City reduce the SB 1383 procurement target - Work with RNG provider to identify options to add refused-derived RNG - Waiver assessments and right-sizing in advance of the contract commencement date, during the transition window - Food donor Edible Food Generator identification during outreach and right-sizing visits to assist with meeting the City's SB 1383 procurement target - Assist City with SMART1383 recordkeeping in any capacity, keeping NASA data live and current at all times within the SMART system by - API or manual updates - Composting workshops & Food Distribution events	- Residential (Single-Family): \$26.00 - Commercial (3cy 1x) \$206.00 - Bid Alternate - Residential Billing: \$120,000 per year per household per month (not included in Residential Rate above and scoring)	Advantages: Scored well in most categories, and received the highest mark for Proposed Rates and References.
							Disadvantages: Size of firm and limited number of exclusive municipal franchises. Minimal Safety and Customer Service information submitted in proposal, and not as detailed as other proposers. Limited Value Added Services provided received lowest score.
Republic Services	- Headquartered in Anaheim. - Employing Approx. 42,000 Personnel. - Fleet of over 17,000 Vehicles.	Serving (11) cities in Orange County including Fullerton (Anaheim, Brea, Fountain Valley, Garden Grove, Huntington Beach, Placentia, Santa Ana, Seal Beach, Villa Park, Yorba Linda), has served or serving (13) in Los Angeles County, has served or serving (1) in San Bernardino County, has served or is serving (2) in San Diego County.	- CVT Anaheim - Recyclables/Mixed Recycling/Organics/Food Waste - San Bernardino Sustainability Park - Organics - Agromin Composting Facility - Organics - Chino - Kochergen Farms Composting - Organics - Avenal - Recology Blossom Valley - Organics - Lamont - Olinda Alpha Landfill - Trash - Brea	Yes	- Full Downtown District review & rate structure - Full SB 1383 compliance (6) months prior - City Event & Community Initiative Funding or Lower Commercial Trash Rates in lieu of Community funding \$200,000 - Partial SB 1383 Procurement Target Contribution \$75,000 - Enhanced Community Cleanliness (Downtown Fullerton Cleaning, service frequency, staffing, & equipment)	- Residential (Single-Family): \$25.82 - Commercial (3cy 1x): \$351.96 - Bid Alternate - Residential Billing: \$0 (At no additional cost)	Advantages: Document Organization, Financial Ability to Perform, and Guaranteed Organic Waste Capacity scores were above average.
							Disadvantages: Received lowest score for SB 1383 Compliance, Operation, and References. In general, the reviewers were concerned with the lack of acknowledgement of current contract compliance, operational, and customer service issues. They also received the lowest score in Exceptions, objecting to the City's preferred CPI and age of fleet requirements. Proposed Commercial rates were among the highest.

Solid Waste RFP Proposal Evaluation Summary

Proposer Name	Company Overview	Municipal Clients	Proposed Facility (Name - Type - Location)	Union (Y - N)	Additional Enhancements	Pricing	Evaluation Criteria Summary
Universal Waste Systems	• Headquartered in Santa Fe Springs. • Employing over 800 personnel. • Fleet of 350 Vehicles.	• Serving (4) municipalities in Orange County, and (18) in Los Angeles County.	• Orange County Landfill System - Trash/Residuals • Universal Waste Systems MRF - Trash/Recyclables/Mixed Waste/ - Santa Fe Springs • Greenwise Soil Technologies - Green Waste - South Gate • UWS 24th Street High Diversion Facility - Organics - Los Angeles • Rialto Bioenergy Facility - Organics	No	• Free portable restrooms at City events • Annual Scholarships to local high school students that have an interest in environmental studies and work \$10,000 • Establish fully staffed local office in Fullerton for customers to visit to learn about recycling, make payments, and inquire on services • Provide compost and mulch to all residents in the City of Fullerton free of charge one time per quarter or four times a year • Unlimited mulch, compost, and wood chips to City of Fullerton facilities, parks, and City projects Annual Sponsorship Minimum \$120,000 • Annual Job Fair to hire locally in the City • Pay for truck driving school for any residents in the City that want to be part of the UWS team • As Fullerton residents become drivers with the firm, they will be eligible to receive a full benefits package, including 401k retirement, full benefits for them and their family, an estimated \$100k per year compensation, life insurance, and will be eligible for a \$2,000 signing bonus upon receiving their commercial Class B license	• Residential (Single-Family) \$20.69 • Commercial (3cy 1x) \$261.98 • Bid Alternate - Residential Billing: \$1.45 per customer per household per month (not included in Residential Rate above and scoring)	Advantages: Second-highest in Project Team and Resumes, Value Added Services, and Local Commitment. Highest ranked in Proposed Rates. Ownership of multiple regional disposal processing facilities, along with a solid waste truck and container manufacturing company, provides an operational advantage.
							Disadvantages: Minimal experience with serving a city comparable to Fullerton, and rolling out a large scale commercial organics program.
Valley Vista Services	• Headquartered in City of Industry. • Employing over 480 personnel. • Full fleet of Vehicles.	• Serving (1) municipality in Orange County, (12) in Los Angeles County.	• Frank R. Bowerman Landfill - Trash/Residual - Irvine • VVS Transfer Station & MRF - Trash/Green Waste/Organics/Recyclables/C&D - City of Industry • San Bernardino Waste-to-Energy Facility - Organics •Waste Management of Orange/Orange County Recycling Center - Recyclables • Madison Materials - C&D - Santa Ana • Bee Canyon Greenery - Organics - Irvine • Recycled Wood Products - Organics - Ontario • Rialto Bioenergy Facility - Organics • El Sobrante Landfill - Trash - Corona	No	• Absorb the costs associated with CPI adjustments and the landfill increase for FY 2027-2028 under the WISE Agreement Contract Rate • Annual Scholarships \$10,000 • Local Hiring & Career Advancement Program • Establish local office in Fullerton • Event, Group & Organization support	• Residential (Single-Family): \$29.24 • Commercial (3cy 1x): \$242.10 • Bid Alternate - Residential Billing: \$0.53 per customer per household per month (not included in Residential Rate above and scoring)	Advantages: Interviewed very well, and presented the largest discount in pricing in their resubmittal to address actual County Landfill rates for July 2027. Very good scores on 9 out of 15 categories including third highest scoring on price.
							Disadvantages: Some reviewers felt the proposal was not organized well and noted missing attachments. Referenced letter from insurance company was not attached which also impacted financial ability to perform scores by a number of evaluators. Concerns over compliance order in Pasadena, insufficient SB 1383 compliance detail, and limited examples of educational materials in comparison to other proposers. Safety and Customer Service marked down for generalized response. Dollar value provided for enhancements was below average.
Ware Disposal	• Headquartered in Santa Ana. • Employing 295 personnel. • Fleet of over 175 Vehicles.	• Serving (4) municipalities in Orange County, (10) in Los Angeles County, and (1) in San Diego County.	• Orange County Landfill System - Trash/Residuals • UWS 24th Street Transfer Facility - Organics - Los Angeles • Universal Waste Systems MRF - Trash/Recyclables - Santa Fe Springs • Puente Hills MRF - Organics • Madison Materials - Recyclables/Mixed Waste - Santa Ana • Rialto Bioenergy Facility - Organics • Innovative Waste Control Transfer - Organics - Vernon • M&D Feeds - Organics • Baker Commodities - Organics - Vernon • Greenwise Soil Technologies - Green Waste - South Gate	Yes	• Corporate vehicle terminal in Fullerton • Complementary valet service & low-income resident discounts • Free event boxes at all City events • Event & Organization sponsorship	• Residential (Single-Family) \$37.73 • Commercial (3cy 1x) \$311.74 • Bid Alternate - Residential Billing: \$1.55 per customer per household per month (not included in Residential Rate above and scoring)	Advantages: Document Organization, SB 1383 Compliance, Financial Ability to Perform, and Operation scoring was good.
							Disadvantages: No area in the reviews resulted in a top three score, and only one in the top four. Lack of experience with an exclusive franchise on par with Fullerton. Indicated letter of commitment for organic processing not relevant to Fullerton. Insufficient illustration of safety operations and training records. Some apprehension with the customer service program not being as robust and localized as other firms presented. Lowest score in Oral Evaluation, not being as prepared or organized as other proposers.

Solid Waste RFP Proposal Evaluation Summary

Proposer Name	Company Overview	Municipal Clients	Proposed Facility (Name - Type - Location)	Union (Y - N)	Additional Enhancements	Pricing	Evaluation Criteria Summary
EDCO	- Headquartered in Signal Hill. - Employing 1,600 personnel. - Full fleet of trucks.	Servicing (2) municipalities in Orange County, (6) in Los Angeles County, and (14) in San Diego County.	- EDCO Recycling & Transfer - Organics/Recyclables/C&D - Signal Hill - Escondido Resource Recovery - Organics - Salton City Landfill - Trash	Yes	- Commitment to establish and Admin Terminal in Fullerton generating additional revenue for the City through property taxes and one-time City sales tax - Escondido high solids Anaerobic Digestion facility slated to be fully operational Summer 2026 - Pledging RNG SB 1383 Procurement credits - Transport up to 6500 tons of SB 1383 loose compost annually at no additional charge, to a City location valued at up to \$80,000 per year - Community Fund \$25,000 (2) Field Supervisors in July 2026, (6) months earlier than industry practice (2) Recycling Coordinators in July 2026, (6) months earlier than industry practice (12) Community Meetings during the transition - Coordinate cart/bin removal activities with the incumbent to ensure there is a seamless transition and leave no customers without a container - Use of the firm's SB 1383 platform at no additional cost - Residential Service - No Additional Charge/Added Free Services include extra recycling cart, extra organics cart up to (3) carts, senior discount 20% -35gal cart, senior discount 15% 65 gal cart, kitchen caddies offered, (2) additional SFR Environmental Times Newsletters, overloaded cart fee, reactivation fee - Commercial Service - No Additional Charge/Added Free Services include overload-cart, gate/restricted access (per month), damaged cart (negligence), damaged bin (negligence), damaged lid (negligence)	- Residential (Single-Family): \$32.75 - Commercial (3cy 1x): \$236.82 - Bid Alternate - Residential Billing: \$1.25 per household per month (not included in Residential Rate above and scoring)	Advantages: Top three in SB 1383 Compliance, Related Experience, Safety and Customer Service, Operation, and Value Added Services. Top scores for Document Organization, Project Team, Other Resources, and Local Commitment. Proposing of local Terminal to house fleet and customer service in the City, generating City revenue through property taxes, sales tax, and potential employment opportunities for residents.
							Disadvantages: No negatives in any scoring category. Would charge \$1.25 per household per month if they took over Residential billing, this would reduce their proposed rate score, dropping them from the top spot, if City chooses hauler billing.
GreenWaste Recovery	- Headquartered in San Jose. - Employing Approx. over 1,000 personnel. - Fleet of Approx. 300 Vehicles.	- No municipalities in Orange County or Southern California. - Serving (23) municipalities in Northern California.	- Olinda Alpha Landfill - Trash - Brea - Frank R. Bowerman Landfill - Trash - Irvine - Orange Transfer Station & MRF - Recyclables - Universal Waste Systems MRF & Transfer Station - Recyclables - Santa Fe Springs - Potential Industries - Recyclables - Wilmington - Greenwise Soil Technologies - Organics - South Gate - Bee Canyon Greenery - Organics - Irvine - Sunset Environmental Irvine Transfer & MRF - C&D/Bulky Item - Madison Materials, Inc. - C&D/Bulky Item - Santa Ana	Both Options	- Edible Food Recovery Support \$105,000 Abound Food Care Consulting - \$70,000 Equipment & Materials - Fix-It-Clinics \$35,000 - Community Composting Program \$40,000 per year assuming one site is built per year - Community Sponsorships \$50,000 - Sponsoring community events - Repurpose existing cart & in turn into compost bins - Establish Customer Service Rep call center in Fullerton - Waste Generation & Characterization studies	- Residential (Single-Family): \$34.94 - Commercial (3cy 1x): \$312.00 - Bid Alternate - Residential Billing: \$0 (At no additional cost)	Advantages: Excellent references and operations in Northern California. One of the best organized proposals. Great local commitment. Fullerton would be their base of operations for planned expansion into Southern California.
							Disadvantages: No local operational experience or facilities. Number of Exceptions taken to City's agreement contributed in second-lowest score. Proposed Value Added Services did not provide the tangible benefits of other proposers. Pricing was among the highest.